

The Nyāyasūtra: on the Ground of Defeat

Book 5, Ch. 2

Wu Chih Ying

Requirements of a valid argument

- See Nyāyapraveśa (translated by Tachikawa)

nigrahasthāna

- nigraha: defeat;
- sthāna: standing;
- If one does the following 22 things, one fails.

1. pratijñāhāni

- pratijñā: proposition, statement;
- hāni: abandonment; damaging, hurting
- “hurting the proposition”

1. pratijñāhāni

Proponent:

pj. sound is impermanent,

ht. because it is cognizable by the senses,

dr. whatever is cognizable by the senses is impermanent, **like pot**

up. (like pot,) sound is cognizable by the senses,

ni. therefore sound is impermanent.

Opponet:

pj. sound is permanent,

ht. because it is cognizable by the senses,

dr. whatever is cognizable by the senses is impermanent, **like pot-ness (genus),**

up. (like pot-ness,) sound is cognizable by the senses,

ni. therefore sound is permanent.

1. pratijñāhāni

- pratijñāhāni occurs when one admits the character of a counter-example in one's own proposition.
- a problem for hetu
- failing to meet **vipakṣe asattva**

2. pratijñāntara

- antara: different from
- “shifting the proposition”
- One in order to defend the proposition being opposed and himself, revise the original one.

2. pratijñāntara

Proponent:

pj. sound is impermanent,

ht. because it is cognizable by the senses,

dr. whatever is cognizable by the senses is impermanent, like pot

up. (like pot,) sound is cognizable by the senses,

ni. therefore sound is impermanent.

(being opposed with the counter-example pot-ness)

pj. sound is **non-all-pervasively** impermanent
(for pot-ness is all-pervasive)

2. pratijñāntara

- What about a qualifier?
- (Nāgārjuna) All dharmas are empty.
- (Bhāviveka) All dharmas are **ultimately** empty.

3. pratijñāvirodha

- virodha: contradiction, inconsistency
- “opposing the proposition”
- It happens when the property to be inferred and its reason are opposed with each other.
- dharmasvarūpaviparītasādhana (法自相相違因) : a contradicted mark(hetu), which proves the opposite of the sādhya itself. (tachikawa)

3. pratijñāvirōdha

pj1. sound is permanent,
ht1. because it is produced

pj2. substance is distinct from quality
ht2. because it is perceived to be non-distinct from color etc.

- the property "being produced" can only be found in the counter-examples (vipakṣa)

4 . p r a t i j ñ ā s a ṁ n y ā s a

- saṁnyāsa: abandonment of, laying aside,
- “renouncing the proposition”
- Being challenged, one disclaims to have proposed the original statement.
- Nāgārjuna’s Law!

5.hetvantara

- “shifting the reason”
- Being challenged, one further argues that the reason proposed should be understood in a different or a more restricted sense.

6. arthāntara

- artha: meaning, (aim, object, purpose)
- “shifting the topic”
- Being challenged, one starts chasing red herrings.
- Nāgārjuna's Law! Again!

7.nirarthaka

- nis/niḥ-ārtha: meaningless
- “the meaningless”

pj. sound is permanent,
ht. because a, b, c, and d

8 . a v i j ñ ā t ā r t h a

- avijñāta-artha: unknown purpose
- “the unintelligible”
- Being opposed and not able to defend one's self, one try to hide his inability in disputation with slippery tricks, such as speaking extremely fast that no one understands him.

9. apārthaka

- apa: away, off
- “the incoherent”
- A incoherent argument is the one that consists of a row of unrelated words without any syntactical or logical order.
- chasing red herrings advanced level

10. aprāptakāla

- aprāpta: not obtained or following from a rule; not valid
- kāla: (a period of) time
- “the inopportune”
- This happens when one does not state his argument orderly, i.e. pratijñā → hetu → dṛṣṭānta → upanaya → nigamana

11.nyūna

- nyūna: deficient
- “saying too little”
- when omitting any one of the five essential members of a valid argument

12. adhika & 13. punarukta

- adhika: additional
- punar: again;
- ukta: uttered, spoken
- “**saying too much**” happens when one gives two (or more than two) different reasons or examples in one argument, while “**repetition**” occurs when one rephrases or says the same thing again.

12. adhika & 13. punarukta

- adhika:

pj. sound is impermanent

ht1. because it is produced

ht2. because it is audible

dr. _____, like pot

12. adhika & 13. punarukta

- punarukta:

- **repetition of words:**

pj1. sound is impermanent

pj2. sound is impermanent

ht. because it is produced

dr. whatever is produced is impermanent, like pot

- **repetition of meaning:**

pj1. sound is impermanent

pj2. sound is perishable

ht. because it is produced

dr. whatever is produced is impermanent, like pot

14 . ananubhāṣaṇa

- an-anu-bhāṣaṇa: not speaking to
- “silence”
- 1. One is rebuked when one turns a deaf ear to the proponent, for a debate can not be carried on like this.
- 2. Or, there may be something like time-limit for the opponent to reject the proponent, if one does not do so within the time-limit, one loses the game.

15 . a j ñ ā n a

- "ignorance"
- One is to be rebuked when one cannot understand the meaning of the proposition proposed by the proponent, while the audience already did.

16. apratibhā

- apratibhā: shyness, timidity
- “non-ingenuity”
- One is to be rebuked when one is not able to hit upon a reply and argue against the opponent.

17 . vikṣepa

- vikṣepa: the act of throwing away
- “evasion”
- One stops the debate by going away to attend another business.
- One will courts humiliation!

18 .matānujñā

- mata: opinion, idea
- anujñā: allow, assent
- “admission of an opinion”
- Instead of removing the charge against one's self, one fights back by accusing the opponent of the same defect.

19 . paṛyāyanuṃyōjyopēkṣāṇa

- pari: away from
- anuṃyōjya: to be examined, questioned
- upa-īkṣāṇa: overlooking
- “overlooking the censurable”
- If the proponent makes a mistake and the opponent fails to point it out, the opponent should be rebuked by the audience.

20.nirānuyojyānuयोगा

- anuyoga: examination, censure
- “censuring the non-censurable”
- One brings discredit on one's self if one rebukes the person who does not deserve it.

21. apasiddhānta

- apa: away, off
- siddhānta: any established, canonical teachings
- “deviating from a tenet”
- One gives in and agrees with the opponent, or one proposes another argument which is opposed with the original one or with the school one belongs to.
- āgamaviruddha (自教相違)

22 . hetvābhāsa

- ābhāsa : appearance, semblance
- vyabhicāra :
the presence of the hetu without the sādhya (;inconclusive marks)
- viruddha : contradicted marks (相違)
- asiddha : unproved
- satpratipakṣa : (the reason given) is the dharmin
- bādha : (suspension)

Thank You!